



TOWNSHIP OF MALAHIDE

Feasibility of the Aylmer Police Service Providing Policing for Malahide Township

Preliminary Report

Submitted by:

Performance Concepts Consulting
124 New Street
Uxbridge, ON L9P 1K9

Submitted to:

Township of Malahide

**Attn: Michelle Casavecchia-Somers,
Chief Administrative Officer/Clerk**
87 John Street
Aylmer, ON N5H 2C3

May, 2020

Table of Contents

1.0	Preamble	1
2.0	Executive Summary	1
3.0	Analysis	2
3.1	Aylmer Police Service Website	2
3.2	Crime Rates and Resources.....	2
3.3	Oversight, Staffing, Training, Deployment and Assistance	3
3.3.1	<i>Oversight</i>	3
3.3.2	<i>Police Officers</i>	3
3.3.3	<i>Court Services / Administration</i>	3
3.3.4	<i>Training</i>	4
3.3.5	<i>Deployment</i>	4
3.3.6	<i>Assistance and Specialty Services</i>	4
3.4	Policing Legislation Changes	5
3.5	Contract Length:	5
3.6	Aylmer's Intentions:.....	5
3.7	Cost Effectiveness:	5
3.8	Budget:.....	6
4.0	Conclusion:	6
5.0	APPENDIX A: Crime Severity Index	7
6.0	Appendix B: Violent Weighted Clearance Rate	8
7.0	Appendix C: Provincial/Specialized Services	9

1.0 Preamble

As part of the Malahide Township Municipal Service Delivery Review now underway, a number of Councillors asked Performance Concepts to provide an opinion on the feasibility of the Aylmer Police Service (APS) providing policing for Malahide Township. This request came as a follow-up to a presentation made to Council by the Aylmer Police Service on October 21, 2019.

In preparation for this report, Performance Concepts consultants interviewed Chief Zvonko Horvat and A/Inspector Nick Novacich, and reviewed the following documents/online resources:

- “Aylmer Police Service – Malahide Costing Proposal” Presentation, October 21, 2019;
- Aylmer Police Service (APS) detailed, “Other Direct Operating Expenses” spreadsheet;
- Ontario Provincial Police (OPP) budget breakdown;
- Ontario Provincial Police Billing Statement for Malahide Township;
- 2015-2019 OPP Municipal Policing Costs;
- Statistics Canada Crime Statistics;
- APS Website;
- APS Annual Report;
- 2016 – 2018 Business Plan;
- 2019 – 2021 Business Plan;
- APS Organizational Chart;
- Aylmer Police Association Collective Agreement; and
- APS Crime Statistics

2.0 Executive Summary

Given the proposed addition of frontline officer resources, the Aylmer Police Service is well situated geographically, and is appropriately staffed and equipped, to provide adequate and effective police services to the Township of Malahide.

The APS proposal guarantees that at least one Police Officer is assigned to Malahide Township at all times. As the OPP have not been able to provide the same assurance, this should result in improved visibility, enforcement, community service and response times. The value-for-money generated by the Aylmer proposal merits serious consideration by Malahide moving forward.

3.0 Analysis

3.1 Aylmer Police Service Website

The Police Service website is easily navigated and provides access to a menu of information and documents including their Business Plan.

The Plan indicates that both internal and external consultation were used to develop their strategic vision. The Plan acknowledges the need to support their employees, to monitor their organizational capacity, and maintain community safety and engagement. The Plan identifies the responsibility to reduce crime and traffic collisions, assist vulnerable persons and victims, and improve community knowledge and relationships.

Of note, the APS received only 3 public complaints for all of 2016, 2017 and 2018. This is one indicator of a positive relationship with the community.

3.2 Crime Rates and Resources

The Aylmer Police Service (APS) is currently providing policing to their own community and are required to meet all of the provincial adequacy standards.

Based on Statistics Canada reports for the past five years, and despite a recent spike in crime, Aylmer's overall crime severity index has consistently been lower than the provincial average (Appendix A); as has Elgin County's crime severity. Although APS's overall clearance rate is lower than the provincial average, their clearance rate for violent crime is slightly better (Appendix B).

The addition of Malahide Township will increase the population policed by Aylmer, from approximately 7,500 to 16,800, lowering APS's officer to population ratio from 187 to 113 officers per 100,000. Statistics Canada indicates the police officer per 100,000 population in Ontario is 176.8. Although the combined officer to population ratio may be lower than the province as a whole, other factors such as calls for service per officer and criminal incidents per officer must be taken into consideration.

The Proposal estimates that the average calls per officer under the proposed model (based on 2018 call volumes) are 265.8 per officer. The APS has demonstrated its ability to meet this challenge, averaged slightly more calls at 269.3 calls per officer over the last 3 years. Responses by call type suggest a similar policing environment. The following comparison shows the number of calls for service in 2018 by APS in Aylmer vs. the OPP in Malahide:

2018	Aylmer	Malahide
Violent Crime	64	41
Property Crime	105	106
Drugs	17	11
Motor Vehicle Collisions	174	120
Mental Health	28	33
Domestic Disturbances	42	44

The rural nature of Malahide Township would suggest a low crime rate. This is supported by Statistics Canada which indicates the 5-year Crime Severity Index average for Elgin County is low at 29.8, as compared to Aylmer's 39.2. No breakdown is available for Malahide Township specifically.

Criminal investigations should therefore not place undue stress on APS's ability to police the Township. Chief Horvat is confident this is the case and has reviewed the frequency and types of calls occurring in the Township.

3.3 Oversight, Staffing, Training, Deployment and Assistance

3.3.1 Oversight

In discussions with the Chief and Inspector we learned that the Board is comprised of individuals with significant business and political acumen. It is his view that the community is supportive of municipal policing and this venture should strengthen that commitment by improving efficiencies. He advised that Aylmer and Malahide have details to finalize should this venture move forward but encouraged Malahide's participation and input into how the new area would be policed.

3.3.2 Police Officers

The proposed staffing model would provide a regular presence of three officers in the overall patrol area, with at least one designated to Malahide. As the OPP is unable to provide the same assurance, the APS model should have a positive impact on visibility, enforcement and response times. Chief Horvat believes this will benefit both communities by providing additional officers 24/7 to respond to calls, provide assistance, conduct community service and proactive enforcement initiatives.

Supervision will be provided by two Sergeants, the Inspector and Chief. Additional supervision for police pursuits is provided by the St. Thomas Police that dispatch APS.

APS is one of a very few police services that take advantage of part-time police officers (typically retired officers) to provide backfill for vacation, sickness and other absences by full-time officers. Less than 0.5% of all police officers in Canada are considered part-time.

3.3.3 Court Services / Administration

During our discussion with the Chief and Inspector, it was learned that the Court Services and Administration staff are able to absorb the Malahide workload within their current work week.

APS works closely with St. Thomas and the OPP in a co-operative arrangement, sharing staff resources to maximize efficiencies in prisoner transport and court attendance.

3.3.4 Training

The 2018 Annual Report indicates that APS officers are assigned to those responsibilities necessary to effectively police their community. With the proximity of the Ontario Police College and relationships with other police services, there has not been a difficulty obtaining the courses necessary to remain current.

Officers are trained in defensive tactics and firearms which would allow APS to conduct their own annual re-qualifications, with another officer as an armourer allowing them to maintain their firearms. Currently however, they partner with the OPP and participate in their annual block training. They also have the option of partnering with other agencies such as St. Thomas Police for annual training.

Officers are assigned to Community Service and organizations that are focused on victim support, vulnerable persons and crime prevention including Crimestoppers, the Situation Table, the Drug Reduction committee and Safer Communities.

Investigative responsibilities include Major Case Investigation, Domestic Violence, Sexual Assault, Drugs, Scenes of Crime Investigation, and Fraud.

The Chief indicated that the only current deficiency is Accident Reconstruction due to a recent retirement, but this is being addressed through training. Additional officers would be trained should the proposal be accepted. The Service also trains all officers in General Investigative Techniques, which exceeds expected standards.

3.3.5 Deployment

The addition of five officers will provide flexibility and improved service for Aylmer, while providing a dedicated officer to Malahide, with two more officers within the immediate area for back-up.

Chief Horvat has a number of deployment options including assigning one officer to each community and another “floating” to improve visibility, conducting focused patrols and enforcement based on community concerns, community service, and responding to calls as needed.

3.3.6 Assistance and Specialty Services

Chief Horvat advised that specialty services and assistance in major cases can be obtained upon request from the Ontario Provincial Police or Municipal Police Services such as St. Thomas or London. He pointed out that OPP Specialized Services are funded by provincial taxes, separate from municipal policing contracts, and include aircraft enforcement, policing of waterways, major investigation support, intelligence, tactical response, canine, underwater search and rescue and more (Appendix C).

The Chief indicated that marine assistance from Fire Rescue, RCMP and the Coast Guard is also available.

It is unknown whether the OPP will charge for specialty services in the future and speculation has been ongoing for many years. However, since the services are funded provincially, one might expect any charge-back would impact OPP detachments and municipal police services equally.

3.4 Policing Legislation Changes

Concerns were noted by Township Staff about pending changes in policing legislation. In addition to the potential of specialty service charge-backs addressed above, there is discussion about requiring increased training and shifting provincial responsibilities to municipalities. While this may have a significant impact on some smaller departments, APS seems well positioned to address any such changes.

3.5 Contract Length:

The length of the contract is an important consideration. Aylmer is looking for a long-term commitment (10-years) which will spread the impact of recruiting costs / potential severance, purchasing / selling of assets. This will also assist in business planning and continuity. A ten-year contract seems reasonable in the circumstances. The Town of Amherstburg recently signed a 20-year contract with Windsor Police with reviews every five years.

3.6 Aylmer's Intentions:

It is recommended that Malahide discuss the longevity of the Aylmer Police Service with the Town prior to making any transition. Although there is always the option to return to OPP or another Municipal Police Service, some assurances should be received that services will be maintained for the length of the contract or beyond, to avoid going through another exercise in the near future.

Questions such as, "Does the Aylmer Police Service foresee any future operational or capital costs that could impact their viability for the term of the contract?", should be asked. A site visit was not undertaken at this time due to COVID 19, and whether the police facility requires significant renovation, repair or replacement is an unknown.

3.7 Cost Effectiveness:

APS is perceived by Malahide Councillors and Staff as an "expensive" police service. With 2018 actual expenditures of \$2,319,710, their policing cost per property is \$924.56 and per capita (based on Census 2016 estimates) cost is \$309.62. The per capita cost compares favourably with the Statistics Canada average per capita policing cost of \$414.00 in 2017/2018.

OPP costs billed for 2018 were \$110.19 per Malahide resident and \$307.30 per Malahide property vs. \$124.81 per Elgin Group resident and \$337.38 per Elgin Group property.

The APS proposal provides pricing of \$1,087,054 for a start-up year (2020 including capital) with an average annual cost over ten years of \$1,098,911. This represents an average annual increase of 3.04%. Statistics Canada reports policing costs as having increased an average of 4.4% per year over the past ten years. The ten-year average cost in the APS proposal represents a policing cost of \$118.26 per Malahide resident and \$325.22 per Malahide property.

While policing costs in Aylmer are significantly higher than those provided by the OPP in Elgin, the decision to pay more and receive both a higher level of service and control of their Police Service, is the Town of Aylmer's. The Township of Malahide has only to evaluate the service level and cost for providing service to the Township. In this

case, APS has proposed a higher level of dedicated service at a very similar cost to that provided by the OPP. While we cannot speak to the Town's reasoning behind their very reasonable costing proposal, it would appear that the benefits to the Town include offsetting a portion of their "back room" overhead costs, while increasing back up human resources. It appears to be a "win-win" for both parties.

We should also mention that in our conversation with the Chief, it was noted that APS has been approached by the Township of Bayham to discuss policing their community as well. While those discussions are at an even earlier stage than Malahide's, it would appear that the potential exists for a shared "East Elgin" policing solution with additional resourcing mass to address joint needs.

3.8 Budget:

There was a concern noted that Aylmer may be undercharging for its services in the proposal, and thus, creating a risk of not being able to operate as effectively as they had been, or needing to ask for additional funds in the future.

Chief Horvat was presented with a lengthy list of questions and during discussions he provided a detailed spreadsheet indicating most expenses have been considered, including operating costs, equipment purchases, and the capacity of non-police staff to assume the Malahide workload,

One area that requires discussion at the outset, are legacy costs. As an example, Section 17.4 of the Aylmer Police Association Collective Agreement provides life insurance for retired members until age 65 with Aylmer paying the premiums, and Section 25.2 provides severance in cases where the police service is disbanded. (i.e. Would Malahide be required to pay 10% of the premiums for retiree benefits? If Malahide decides to return to the OPP, would they be responsible for the corresponding severance cost?) Agreements between Stratford and St. Mary's or Amherstburg and Windsor may be helpful in this regard.

4.0 Conclusion:

The Aylmer Police Service is capable, and well situated geographically, to provide policing to the Township of Malahide that meets or exceeds adequacy standards.

Legacy costs, potential capital expenditures, and the longevity of the APS should be confirmed at the outset of any negotiations.

In addition, the Township should expect to fund some life-cycle capital costs should they sign on for an additional term beyond the recommended 10 year first term. While ongoing vehicle replacement is addressed through a contribution to capital, other items with a lifespan of longer than the ten-year contract, are not. Equipment such as pistols may need to be replaced after the ten-year mark. Longer term facility lifecycle costs are unclear at this time.

5.0

APPENDIX A: Crime Severity Index

Ontario: (Five Year Average – 54.11)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Crime Severity Index	49.93	51.05	53.29	56.34	59.96

Aylmer: (Five Year Average – 39.22)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Crime Severity Index	34.12	27.65	35.75	47.64	50.92

Elgin County: (Five Year Average – 29.84)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Crime Severity Index	27.31	26.18	30.96	33.92	30.84

6.0 Appendix B: Violent Weighted Clearance Rate

Ontario: (Five Year Average - 63.09)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Violent weighted clearance rate	63.43	63.71	63.42	63.36	61.51

Aylmer: (Five Year Average - 67.97)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Violent weighted clearance rate	76.84	61.08	74.68	48.05	79.19

Elgin County: (Five Year Average – 93.64)

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Violent Weighted Clearance Rate	96.68	79.43	81.59	120.66	89.85

7.0 Appendix C: Provincial/Specialized Services

RESOURCES

MUNICIPAL POLICING RECOVERIES

Detachment Staff*

- Supervision
- Frontline Constables
- Civilian Administrative Support

Support Positions (Cost Recovery Formula)*

- Communication Operators
- Prisoner Guards
- Provincial Police Academy and In-Service Training
- Uniform Recruitment
- Municipal Policing Bureau
- Forensic Identification
- Information Technology and Telephone Support
- Regional Headquarters

PROVINCIAL/SPECIALIZED SERVICES

Traffic Safety

- Aircraft Enforcement
- Provincial Traffic Safety Program
- Motorized Snow/Off-Road/Vessel Enforcement
- Waterways and King's Highways

Investigations

- Criminal
- Child Exploitation
- Anti-Rackets
- Organized Crime
- Investigative Support

Intelligence

- Covert Operations
- Provincial Anti-Terrorism and Hate Crimes
- Analysis and Information
- Field Intelligence

Specialized Response Teams

- Tactical and Emergency Medical Services
- Aviation Services
- Canine Unit
- Emergency Response Team
- Crisis Negotiation
- Tactics and Rescue Unit
- Underwater Search and Recovery Unit
- Urban Chemical Response Team

Auxiliary Policing

Community Safety

Unincorporated Territory

Indigenous Policing



